

March 14, 2008

TO: Teresa Parsons
Director's Review Program Supervisor

FROM: Kristie Wilson
Director's Review Investigator

RE: **Dale Hubbard v. Central Washington University (CWU)**
Allocation Review No. ALLO-07-031

On February 22, 2008, we conducted a Director's review meeting by telephone conference call at the Department of Personnel, 2828 Capitol Boulevard, Olympia, Washington, concerning the allocation of Mr. Hubbard's position. Present during the telephone conference call were Mr. Hubbard, Amy Murphy WFSE, Karla Shugart, CWU Human Resource Office, Greg Poe Manager of Custodial and Grounds Services, and John Storlie Transportation Supervisor.

Background

On January 11, 2007 Mr. Hubbard submitted a signed Position Review Request form (PRR) (Exhibit 4), Position Description Form (PDF) (Exhibits 5 and 6), and a Maintenance Custodian Lead: Drilling Down document (Exhibit 7) to CWU's Human Resource Office, requesting that his Custodian 3 position be reallocated to either a Maintenance Mechanic (MM) 2, 3 or 4 classification. In a memorandum dated April 10, 2007, Eric Galbrath CWU Human Resources, notified Mr. Hubbard that his position was properly allocated to the Custodian 3 classification (Exhibit 3). CWU does not believe Mr. Hubbard's position fits in the MM 2 classification because it describes journey level or skilled work, and the university does not believe Mr. Hubbard's assigned work meets this standard. Further, the MM 3 classification describes work being performed in more than one trade or craft, typically with a specialization. Again, CWU describes Mr. Hubbard's work as not reaching this standard. The MM 4 classification describes supervision or expert level work, and Mr. Hubbard performs lead work.

On April 12, 2007, the Department of Personnel received Mr. Hubbard's request for a Director's Review of CWU's allocation determination (Exhibit 1).

The following summarizes Mr. Hubbard's perspective as well as CWU's.

Summary of Mr. Hubbard's Perspective

Mr. Hubbard asserts that his position best fits in the Trades Helper/General Maintenance Occupational category as an MM 1 or 2 but believes the MM 2 would be the best fit. Mr. Hubbard agrees that the job description documents (PRR, PDF, and the Drilling Down Position Description, written by John Storlie) is an accurate reflection of his work.

During the conference call, Mr. Hubbard stated that he leads a crew consisting of one Maintenance Custodian 2, a part-time window washer, and a number of temporary employees. He is responsible for every aspect of work performed by the crew. His crew is a mobile crew which means he leads and performs the work. The following is a list of some of Mr. Hubbard's responsibilities mentioned in our meeting:

- Assign work and purchase materials as needed.
- Perform aerial lift work which entails operating forklifts, pallet jacks, and all motorized equipment.
- Build and construct scaffolding to use to change or set up lighting to assist the electricians or other maintenance workers.
- Responsible for training your crew on the man lifts.
- Perform estimates for specific jobs, under the oversight of your supervisor.
- Perform building maintenance using blowers and/or snow plows to clear out entry ways.
- Responsible for cleaning the inside of the entry ways.
- Perform pest control which includes ant traps, mouse traps, and bee traps.
- General maintenance of the swimming pools, fire extinguishers, bathroom lights on campus, cleaning glass, furniture repair, delivery, and set up.
- Perform preventive maintenance on equipment.
- Assist plumbers and electricians when necessary but mainly help set up and perform clean up afterwards. Mr. Hubbard described his plumbing experience as working with flush valves, replacing batteries, and changing toilet seats and dispensers.

Summary of Central Washington University's (CWU's) Reasoning

CWU contends the primary purpose for Mr. Hubbard's position is to lead a crew in performing a variety of custodial and general maintenance work on buildings, facilities, and equipment. His work during the six month period prior to the request for review included performing duties and leading other staff in the following areas: swimming pool maintenance, maintaining and repairing lighting fixtures, maintaining custodial equipment, and performing a variety of other general maintenance tasks such as minor plumbing repairs, maintaining fire extinguishers, and repairing furniture. In addition, Mr. Hubbard and his crew are responsible for window washing, maintaining building entryways, hanging flags on campus walkways, rodent control, moving materials, furniture, and equipment, and setting up for special events.

CWU feels that although Mr. Hubbard performs minimal custodial or housekeeping duties, he does perform general maintenance work as established in the custodial services occupation category. The Custodian 3 classification does allow for lead and/or supervision.

Director's Determination

This position review was based on the work performed for at least the six-month period prior to January 11, 2007, the date Mr. Hubbard submitted his Position Review Request to CWU's Human Resource Office.

As the Director's Review Investigator, I carefully considered all of the documentation in the file, the exhibits presented during the Directors Review meeting, and the verbal comments provided by all parties. Based on my review and analysis of Mr. Hubbard's assigned duties and responsibilities, I conclude that his position is properly allocated to the Custodian 3 classification.

Rationale for Determination

During the Director's review meeting, all parties agreed that the current Position Description Form for Mr. Hubbard's position is accurate. The category concept for the Custodial Services Occupational Category form states that positions "perform a variety of custodial, housekeeping, and general maintenance functions...." (Exhibit 9). The basic function of a Custodian 3 position, as stated in the distinguishing characteristics, notes that positions "lead and/or supervise assigned personnel performing various custodial and housekeeping duties." Positions also regularly assign, instruct, and check the work of others, interview and recommend selection of applicants, conduct training, assign and schedule work, act upon leave requests, conduct annual performance evaluations and recommend disciplinary action. The distinguishing characteristics described in Exhibit 9 are consistent with the description of Mr. Hubbard's duties.

The class series concept for Trades Helper/General Maintenance positions notes that "positions perform general maintenance, repair, remodeling and construction duties utilizing working knowledge of several related skill fields such as electrical, plumbing, carpentry, welding, painting and machinist work." During the Director's review meeting, Mr. Hubbard and Ms. Murphy (WFSE) pointed out that Mr. Hubbard's position performs general maintenance tasks, which they believe fit in the level of the MM series. However, the general maintenance work assigned to Mr. Hubbard's position fits within the Custodial Services Occupational Category, which also includes general maintenance functions. During the Director's Review meeting, Ms. Shugart (CWU) noted that the employees Mr. Hubbard leads do not perform maintenance mechanic work, while Ms. Murphy argued the review was based on Mr. Hubbard's work, not the employees Mr. Hubbard leads.

When comparing Mr. Hubbard's assigned duties to the MM 1 or 2 levels, his position does not meet the level of work of the MM 1 or 2 levels because Mr. Hubbard makes only minor and infrequent repairs. Additionally, any substantial repairs in plumbing or electrical are referred to the plumbing or electrical divisions. Although the MM 1 level performs semi-skilled and sub journey level work, the scope of the work relates to maintenance and repair in skill fields such as

electrical, plumbing or carpentry work. During the Director's Review meeting, Mr. Hubbard explained that his primary role in assisting electricians, plumbers or carpenters involves set up, such as putting up scaffolding or operating aerial lifts, and clean up maintenance. The MM 2 level is the journey level of the series and all parties agreed that your position does not perform journey level work.

After reviewing all of the documentation and comments from all parties with regard to Mr. Hubbard's assigned custodial duties and responsibilities, I conclude the Custodian 3 classification best describes his position.

Appeal Rights

RCW 41.06.170 governs the right to appeal. RCW 41.06.170(4) provides, in relevant part, the following:

An employee incumbent in a position at the time of its allocation or reallocation, or the agency utilizing the position, may appeal the allocation or reallocation to . . . the Washington personnel resources board Notice of such appeal must be filed in writing within thirty days of the action from which appeal is taken.

The address for the Personnel Resources Board is 2828 Capitol Blvd., P.O. Box 40911, Olympia, Washington, 98504-0911.

If no further action is taken, the Director's determination becomes final.

Enclosure: List of Exhibits